Performing Photography:
Images From My Father

Paul Feder
Interactive Telecommunications Program
May 4, 2006
PART I: INTRODUCTION

Thesis Statement:
Photographic material from a past era is a static record, yet a sense of performance, life, and immediacy can be drawn out and amplified through live image processing and a close interaction with music.

Description:
This project encompasses a multimedia performance of my own musical compositions paired with still photographs and silent films by my father, Jack Feder. The imagery, shot all around the world in the 1960s and ’70s, is made performable through the use of interactive technology. In this work, music has been written to accompany the images, and the imagery is performed and projected alongside live musicians, creating an interactive dialogue to draw the spectator deeper into the world of the photograph.

PART II: PERSONAL STATEMENT

I have a background in electronic music, filmmaking and theater. My varied interests trace their roots to my upbringing; I have a family full of artists. In addition to being psychologists, my mother makes collage and my father photographs. The rest of my family includes writers, painters, designers, etc. When I was a child, there was always music playing in my home, and every available inch of wall space was covered in art. My family has undoubtedly influenced my own goals in fusing a variety of media into unified performance.

It was during my undergraduate years at Wesleyan University that I discovered electronic music. After receiving a synthesizer as a high school graduation present, I began to put it to use in the turbulent first year of college, experimenting, brooding and tinkering, until to my surprise, I started to produce decent music. With sequencing software at my disposal, I was able to compose by ear, despite my lack of formal musical training. It quickly became apparent that composing music was not merely a hobby, but a passion. Throughout college I worked on an album that I entitled “Lakeland”. While composing, I imagined I was writing for an epic animated film or video game. People listening to my
music would often comment that they found it to be visually evocative. After a while, I knew I had visual stories to tell as well.

At this time I became interested in the medium of film. Having grown up watching MTV music videos, and being a fan of contemporary classical music, I was drawn to films such as *Koyaanisqatsi*, directed in 1983 by Godfrey Reggio, with music by Philip Glass. This film consists of silent footage documenting the accelerating pace of the modern world, and brings the score and image together in a way in which I had never seen before. On many a weeknight (when we should have been studying), my friends and I would put together our own ‘Qatsi-like’ shows by taking old silent films like Fritz Lang’s *Metropolis*, and setting it to music of our choice, or watching the classic combination of *The Wizard of Oz* and Pink Floyd’s album *Dark Side of the Moon*. I loved the way the old movies interacted with modern music. Many wonderful moments in the films were amplified or even created by chance synchronizations of music and image. The phenomenon of synchresis in film was fascinating to me; the effect of an image and sound coming together and creating the illusion that the two are fundamentally linked, or have a causal relationship (the brain, in making sense of the world, seeks such accord, creating connections even if there are none apparent). Sometimes it was the exactitude of a musical and visual rhythm that amazed me, and sometimes it was the thematic contrast of joyful music set to poignant imagery or vice versa that made for unusual juxtapositions.

Around this time, I became interested in the idea of setting still images to music. Unfortunately, in a catastrophic moment of dropping my laptop on the floor, I erased my first foray into such territory. My roommate and I had laboriously searched and archived hundreds of images of daguerreotypes from the Internet, being fascinated by these old portraits of people from a hundred years ago. The long exposure time required to create a daguerreotype meant that the people posing had to sit perfectly still, contributing to the intensity of these images. We arranged them into a slide show set to a slow song by the Cranberries (“No Need To Argue”), creating a mood-based piece in which the images faded in and out slowly along to the mournful tune about breaking up with a loved one.
The music worked extremely well with the imagery, helping to amplify their power. Since that time, I have wanted to put that project back together again in some form; to realize the idea of synchronizing old-fashioned photographic imagery with music.

The last few years of my life have been difficult. After college, I moved back home to help my parents through an extremely rough financial and emotional period in their lives. During this time, my father suffered two strokes and is currently wheelchair-bound. Recently, my parents have had to move from their home of many years to a smaller apartment. In helping with the move, I was the one in charge of going through my father’s closets, which were upstairs and inaccessible to him. Sifting through a lifetime of dusty clothing, books, letters and other assorted memories, I was struck by the history behind each item, some of which hadn’t been touched in decades. Then, I came across bins of 8mm film footage that my father had taken in the 1960s and ’70s on trips to Africa, Japan, Hawaii, India, France, and other countries. I had always heard him tell these epic sagas from his travels, but here was physical documentation. I brought the reels to a lab and had them digitally transferred. Seeing it for the first time, I stood agape, mesmerized by the footage, a silent record of people and places across the world. I was also struck by the special gritty nature of the 8mm film stock itself, a quality lacking in digital video. As I watched all the footage, I began to hear music that could go along with the imagery.

Recently, my father, who was forced to retire due to his condition, has been scanning hundreds of the still photos he has taken since he started photographing in the 1960s. Digitizing, archiving and touching up these old photos has given my father a renewed sense of purpose. Helping him with this project has brought us closer in a new way – through his art. In particular, he has been working on his photos of the Lower East Side in the 1960s and ’70s, which he feels represent some of his best photographic work. These photos of people in the city—street scenes—have a striking attitude and gritty flavor. He managed to capture very human moments amidst the city during a particularly interesting era in American history. As I helped him search through all these pictures, it occurred to me – why not try to recreate that sense of stillness and beauty that I lost in the
Part III: My Work at ITP

At ITP, I collaborated on two projects that involved still photographs. For a group project in the introductory class at ITP taught by Red Burns, I worked on a five-minute slide show set to Philip Glass music (with fellow students Henry Harvey, John Kirchherr, and Aya Ota). The photos were collected from the Internet, and portrayed the accelerating pace of American life between 1950 and the present. The music and photos started off slowly and peacefully with images of family life, building up to the frenetic digital age in which we find ourselves today. Images were cut rhythmically to the music, and towards the end, images flew by faster and faster, and were mixed with video footage of Times Square, newscasters, etc.

This project was a direct nod to Koyaanisqatsi, and I believe it brought up some of the same questions that the ‘Qatsi’ trilogy raises. I find that using photos of people as mere symbols of an era, rather than as individual human beings, produces a certain distancing effect. This isn’t always necessarily a negative, and in the case of Koyaanisqatsi, it works particularly well. In the case of the sequel, Powaqqatsi, I find the same objectification of people problematic. In this film, the focus is not on the ‘First World’ as with Koyaanisqatsi, but on the ‘Third World’. Perhaps it’s my Wesleyan University conditioning, but I find that a strong Western bias and worldview show through the well-intentioned film as images of people from all over the Southern Hemisphere are equated in their ‘ethnic’, ‘primitive’ status while the film makes a point about the negative impacts of globalization and modernization. This is something I am very conscious of in working with my father’s 8mm footage from Africa and Japan; I want to steer clear of any sense of objectification while I celebrate the human moments my father experienced and recorded on film. I am aware that in using documentary footage of real people, whatever their nationalities, brings up certain questions, i.e., the consent of the
photographic subject and the potential biases of the photographer, etc. Nevertheless, it is my hope that as long as the images and the people therein are treated with a sense of awareness and respect, one should be able to avoid getting lost in such a quagmire.

Another project I worked on, “Plane Spaces” (with Henry Harvey, Ernesto Rios and Champion Dickerson), involved a sequence of digital photographs placed in a virtual three-dimensional space, projected onto a curved screen. The viewer of this installation piece could control how fast he/she ‘traveled’ through the sequence of photos. The attempt was to make the experience of looking at photographs a more spatial, immersive experience. However, I found that the three-dimensionality of the interface only served to reinforce how flat and artificial each image really was. I am left with the notion that rather than trying to turn photography into something that it isn’t, I should celebrate it for what it is, on its own terms, without the use of dramatic 3D effects.

Also at ITP, I have learned how to build my own musical instruments and interfaces. Ever since I started composing electronic music, I have wanted to bring my music (created in the solitude of my room, tapping on my computer and keyboard) into the open, in an exciting audiovisual performance. I love performing, and have always felt the pull of the stage—throughout high school and college, I acted in many musicals and plays. Through the interactive technologies I have learned at ITP, I have had the opportunity to bring my musical, visual, and theatrical interests together. I have spent the past two years creating musical devices that provide visual feedback to the audience in the form of light and color.

I started on the path to building my own instruments in my first semester at ITP, during which I worked on a prototype of a “laser guitar” with Ariel Viazcaino and Henry Harvey, entitled “Guitaromatic 5000”. It was a simple system of three lasers hitting three different photocells, and when a beam was broken, a MIDI note would play. I showed this simple design to friends and family, all of whom were drawn in by the play of the red laser light on my fingers as I “magically” strummed the air. Starting with
“Guitaromatic”, the idea of a straightforward sound/light correlation and a performance-oriented approach to interface design has driven much of my work at ITP.

It was Gideon D’Arcangelo’s class, “New Interfaces For Musical Expression”, that refined my ideas of designing musical interfaces with an audience in mind. As we discussed in Gideon’s class, in much of contemporary computer music, a sense of performance is missing. The core problem in a “laptop performance” is that an audience has no way of understanding what the performer is doing as he or she types on the laptop. On the other end of the spectrum, a highly complex, fully gestural interface can also run into the problem of producing audience confusion as to what sounds are being mapped to what gestures, and why. For the final performance of this class, I designed the “Spherion”, a MIDI controller/DJ tool that consists of four six-inch orbs filled with LEDs. When one of the orbs is tapped with a finger, a sound loop is triggered, and the sphere lights up. This relatively straightforward interface has been met with a positive audience response. As I am discovering, simplicity of design is not necessarily a limitation.

In Luke DuBois’ class, “Algorithmic Composition”, I created a new instrument, entitled “LoopLight”. It is a cube-shaped MIDI interface that algorithmically generates melodies and represents them visually as a circular pattern of light. As a composer, I am inspired by the possibilities of combining algorithmic composition with live improvisation. As a performer, I like the feeling of ‘rocking out’ with a musical instrument on stage. To make the performance more dynamic and expressive, this instrument therefore allows for dramatic Theremin-like gestural control over the phrasing of the melodies.

I came to ITP seeking to bring my interests together, and to master the technology necessary to achieve that goal. Even though I feel I have disparate interests spanning film, video, electronic music, chamber music, and physical computing, there is a common thread in what I’ve been trying to accomplish: bringing the musical and visual together in performance.
PART IV: CONTEXT

My thesis project encompasses several areas of artistic practice: silent film, film scoring, ‘found footage’ filmmaking, and VJ-ing (live video mixing). My project traces its roots back to 1895, when the Lumière Brothers showed their first films to the public. During this screening of short documentary-type footage, a pianist provided music to accompany the imagery. Between this time and the advent of sound on film in the late 1920s, the projection of silent film went hand-in-hand with live music. This was a natural phenomenon, which grew out of traditions of both opera and vaudeville performance. Film, a radically new medium, was thus grounded in live theatrical performance during its inception.

In the absence of dialogue, music was essential in conveying narrative and bringing a sense of life and humanity to the screen images. Solo pianists, organists, or ensembles would play along to the film, sometimes improvising (in the case of soloists), sometimes playing an established score. The general term for music written for silent film is “Photoplay Music”, which falls into three categories: the fully original score composed specifically for the individual film, the fully improvised score, and the score consisting of stock themes. For the latter, composers were hired to write general, stock music for soloists or orchestras playing at a screening. The conductor would draw from this large set of very short musical compositions to signify changes in mood and action of the film. Often, it would take improvisation to seamlessly move through the movie, transitioning through these pre-composed themes.

At MASS MoCA in 2001, I attended a performance of Philip Glass music paired with a series of new short silent films by contemporary filmmakers. The Philip Glass Ensemble played music along with the screening of the films, in the silent movie tradition. The music/image pairings were interesting experiments in that Glass “asked four international filmmakers… to create short films for which he then wrote new musical scores. There were no rules, no guidelines, just the belief that approaching film through the music would result in a poetic combination of sound and images full of fresh possibilities.”
Some of the films worked very well with the music, and some didn’t, but it was inspirational to hear and see Philip Glass live in a cinematic experience.

A prime example of a modern take on silent cinema is Bill Morrison and Michael Gordon’s Decasia (2002). This is a Koyaanisqatsi-like film that consists of a montage of old, decaying footage set to orchestral music. Now available on DVD, it was originally conceived as a performance involving live musicians. The power of Morrison’s film lies in the quality of the film stock itself, and in the human beings that appear through the layers of scratches, grit and decay. The presence of a photographic reminder of the passage of time as symbolized by aging film, framing a human being that looks just as young or old a hundred years later, is quite haunting. This special quality of aging film has been examined by Susan Sontag in her book, On Photography:

…The depredations of time tend to work against paintings. But part of the built-in interest of photographs, and a major source of their aesthetic value, is precisely the transformations that time works upon them, the way they escape the intentions of their makers. Given enough time, many photographs do acquire an aura.

It’s interesting to note that especially now, in the digital era, aging film becomes a precious art object, even though seventy years ago Walter Benjamin thought of the mechanical nature of film as signifying the end of ‘aura’ in the art world.

Decasia becomes a metaphor for life and death, the relentless pace of time, and the disintegration of memory. Yet the human beings trapped in Bill Morrison’s film exist as ghostly echoes of the past, achieving new life and ‘aura’, evoking nostalgia in the viewer. The music of Decasia helps to emphasize this through a unified score that is at once disturbing and strongly emotional: “It’s amazing to me that an experimental black-and-white film made up of decaying film stock from 50 years ago can bring out such intense emotions in an audience.” Morrison and Gordon artfully bring out the human amidst a sea of seemingly ancient decay.
Although films like *Decasia* and *Koyaanisqatsi* are inspirations for me, they do not fully encompass what I am trying to accomplish with my thesis project, i.e., pairing a live musical performance with live image mixing. Making projected imagery more performable is the primary aim of ‘Performance Cinema’, ‘Performance Photography’, and VJ-ing. I found “The VJ Book” by Paul Spinrad to be inspiring in researching live video performance. This book contains numerous interviews with prominent figures in the field. Although the term “VJ” (Video Jockey, as opposed to Disc Jockey) has a clear dance club connotation, the book also explores video for ‘sit down’ or gallery events as well.

In an interview with Paul Spinrad and photographer Bill Cottman, a straightforward notion of ‘Performance Photography’ is discussed. Cottman explains that his interest in bringing photographs into a public performance space began in the early 1970s, when he began putting on slide shows synched to music (which is interesting—my father tells me that around that time he would have private viewings of his own slides, projected with music playing in the background). Recently, Cottman has developed a show entitled *FOUR WOMEN: stories of Freedom, Identity & Responsibility*, a celebration of the strong women who have touched his life. Cottman performed these photos along with a poet, triggering the images and doing transitions from his laptop along to the spoken word.

Holding a still photo and letting it sink in with the audience is a very simple and powerful technique to draw the audience into the world of the image. As noted by Susan Sontag, motion picture footage flickers in and out and flies by, yet a still photograph carries with it a sense of permanence, and thus, importance. For an audience member, the details of the image therefore become much more apparent. This is evident in Chris Marker’s *La Jetée* (1962), a classic example of how still images can come alive onscreen. The entire film is composed of black-and-white still photographs that endow the futuristic story with a sense of weight, longing and tragedy. A very different use of stills can be found in Ken Burns’ epic documentaries of the Civil War, and the Jazz Era. The “Ken Burns” effect is
by now a common technique; a slow pan or zoom into a photo of a historic figure with narration and music.

The idea of ‘Performance Cinema,’ championed by filmmaker Henry Warwick (who created the San Francisco Performance Cinema Symposium in 2003), is an attempt to make the cinematic/concert experience more immediate through controlling imagery in real time. Warwick explains: “Movies are diachronic; they exist outside of time… Performance cinema is synchronic. The video that’s flying out comes from someone’s actions at that time, which makes everyone invest in that particular moment”. This promotes the idea of a live visual performance that isn’t necessarily ‘VJ’ in nature, but more akin to the aesthetic of chamber music, modern dance, or experimental electronic music. A good example of Performance Cinema is John Zalben’s *Organized Color Intoxication*. Zalben is a New York City-based composer and live video artist. His piece consists of string players who control various effects on the pre-recorded video footage coming out of his laptop, mixed with live video of a dancer on the stage. I’ve seen this performed several times, and each performance had its own visual and musical character, emphasizing the ‘live’ quality of his work, and the possibilities of a cinematic experience that is not rigidly fixed.

It is my hope that the live mixing of imagery adds a more human layer to a performance than a fixed film. However, one can encounter the same ‘laptop performance’ issue as in performing computer music—what is the video performer actually doing with his or her hands? Is it enough for the audience to ‘know’ that I am performing, even if they don’t directly connect gesture to output? However, a fully gestural interface for video is not as intuitive a solution as with music, especially when the imagery is based in representational photography. Perhaps in a performance involving 3D computer-generated graphics, a tight coupling between gesture and output is more appropriate (for instance, if my hand were to move, and a geometric shape were to move across the screen). For this project, however, I don’t want to detract from the weight of the human imagery nor from the musicians. However, I have to balance this with my desire to *perform* the imagery. For these reasons, I have decided to perform on stage from my
laptop with a non-obtrusive MIDI controller, without the use of something like my “Spherion” or “LoopLight”, which might detract from the overall mood of the imagery. In addition, I have decided to make use of live camera work on the performers themselves (in a similar fashion to John Zalben’s work). The advantage of this performance technique is twofold: as the audience watches the musicians mirrored on the screen in real time, the visuals and live music become unified, and the audience is cued that the visuals are indeed being performed live.

In addition to Performance Cinema, my thesis project is also a ‘found footage’ piece. That is to say, I am ‘sampling’ archived imagery from a past era. Seen this way, the fact that the imagery was taken by my father is perhaps more personal and anecdotal, rather than of prime artistic significance. The act of taking found film footage and repurposing it is popular among many film and video artists (such as Christian Marclay) and VJs. There are different types of ‘found footage’ pieces:

Variously known as compilation, archival, collage, assemblage, montage, or recycled films, works incorporating found footage can take a range of different forms. Film scholar William C. Wees has simplified the matter by reducing the terms and categories to three—compilation, collage, and appropriation— noting that found-footage films can be classified as one or more of these types. Some of the resulting film forms are quite complex and may superimpose the documentary realism of compiled archival footage along with modernist collage techniques and postmodern appropriation.

I would categorize my project as a mixture of compilation, collage, and appropriation. I am acting as a curator of my father’s work, creating a compilation of images that creates a window onto his life as a photographer. I am mixing footage together and creating juxtapositions that make sense to me in a collage-like fashion. Finally, by placing the footage and stills in a new performance context, with my own music that creates a sense of narrative arc, I am appropriating the imagery for a new artistic purpose. Of course, my father has had input into the whole process, and the fact that I know the source of my ‘sampling’ personally is, finally, relevant to my piece.
PART V: METHODOLOGY

This performance combines the acoustic and electronic in music, as well as the filmic and digital in imagery; this is a piece for string quartet and electronics, and the film is digitally processed and projected. The performance, entitled “Cycles”, is laid out in three movements. In all three sections I will be performing the visuals live alongside the musicians with the use of the program Max/MSP/Jitter. My role will be that of a VJ, triggering and mixing the imagery.

The process of creating this work, from the selection of my father’s images to the musical composition to rehearsals with live musicians to the final performance has brought the images and music closer and closer together. I wrote large sections of the score as I looked at the photography and film footage. Other sections were the opposite, in that I chose images to fit with music I had already written. The feedback loop of image to music to image carries over to the actual performance, where I trigger and process images in response to the live musicians. Although the performance is aided and mediated through technology, I have taken care to prevent the technology from becoming the focus of the piece. For instance, the effects I put on the photographic imagery are subtle and infrequent, allowing the photography to speak for itself.

In writing music that creates its own story arc, I am necessarily creating a narrative flow out of my father’s photographic material. However, I am not trying to tell a specific story in the traditional sense, but rather one based on associative connections. I started out with a general idea of the emotions of the piece, and only during the actual creative process did specific narrative lines, recurring imagery and musical leitmotifs start to surface. I have chosen to compose music in a minimalist style (reminiscent of Philip Glass and Steve Reich) that I find to be suggestive, as opposed to being forceful or manipulative. Ideally, I’d like the viewer to make the connections between image and sound for him/herself, on a personal level, much like the times back in college when I would put on silent films set to music of my choice. This is not to say that I haven’t exerted control over the flow of the piece, or put thought into creating the music/image
connection, it’s just that I want to leave it open to interpretation, and to the audience’s imagination.

Movement I of “Cycles” consists of live musicians (a string quartet and a keyboardist) playing along with electronic rhythmic loops, with projections of 8mm footage cut to the music. As this is the first time I’ve composed for acoustic instruments, I have enlisted the aid of another composer, Sam McCoy, to help with the arrangement and with segments of the composition. The imagery itself, shot by my father in the ’60s and ’70s, portrays groups of people in motion, in particular Japanese and African dancers. Opening the piece is the title sequence, which appears over ‘header’ footage, establishing the work as shot on film. The music starts as a Japanese man spins a baton in a graceful, hypnotic manner, as part of the Gion Festival in Kyoto, filmed in 1968. This ceremony also features dancers dressed as swans. Throughout “Cycles,” motifs of birds in flight and people in motion are explored, and returned to in Movement III. I also use footage that my father took of birds in Hawaii at around the same time period. During the African dance section, filmed in Kenya in 1973, there is also a sense of bird-like movement.

Still from 8mm footage: Gion Festival in Kyoto, Japan, 1968. By Jack Feder
Musically, I have tried to emphasize the beauty and power of the dance through the music. I have chosen the time signature of 5/4 for this first section to give a sense of syncopation and rhythmic complexity to amplify the dance footage. This movement is in G Major (whereas the second movement is in E minor, and the third is in D Major). Backing the string players are rhythmic and melodic loops, including a drum pattern that is synchronized with the Kenyan dancers.

Movement II is a slow piece for the string quartet alone, without any electronic sounds. Projected on screen are still photographs of street scenes from the Lower East Side in Manhattan in the 1970s. As the string players play through the score, I control the transitions between the photographs. Sam McCoy and I worked very closely on the composition of this piece with the stills in mind. I am drawn to the human portraits amidst the gritty background of the neighborhood. My father captured moments of solitude, featuring lone figures framed by decaying buildings, as well as moments shared by pairs of people; conversing, hugging, laughing, arguing, etc. The music is more subdued and plaintive than the more celebratory first movement, yet contains similar motifs, and is in 4/4. The music, with its almost funereal pace, captures and amplifies the powerful nature of the photographs.
During Movement III, the performers are incorporated into the video layer; the projected imagery consists not only of the photography, but also live video of the string quartet. They are superimposed with my father’s more “ambient” 8mm footage, i.e., shots of water coursing down a river, the flight of a lone bird across the sky, etc. In addition to being a part of the visual content, during this time the musicians are invited to improvise, bringing the audience’s attention further into the energy of the live performance moment. Musically, this section contains elements from the first two movements; the 5/4 rhythm of Movement I returns, but is overlaid with the strings playing in 4/4 as in Movement II. The main chord progression contains hints of the first two movements, yet ascends in a brighter manner. The serious mood of Movement II will be thus answered by the levity of this section, which includes a strong 4/4 dance beat. Visually, there are echoes of Movement I, creating a cyclic return to the beginning of the piece; I would like the audience to leave with the feeling of having traveled on an emotional journey through a live cinematic experience. The three-act structure contributes to this effect; there is a definite beginning, middle and end.

Working with my father’s photography has given me a new direction for my own art. This has been a very personal experience for me; I’ve never before embarked on such a project. I don’t want “Cycles” to end with one performance; I hope I will be able to perform this numerous times to refine it and perhaps expand it into a broader piece.
PART VI: CONCLUSION

On April 22, 2006, I performed “Cycles” at Galapagos Art Space in Williamsburg, Brooklyn. This was part of a lineup of other ITP students performing audiovisual works. As it was very important to me to perform my thesis in a live, non-academic setting, I approached Galapagos in the early spring and organized the event, which turned out to be quite a success. The experimental atmosphere of Galapagos Art Space was conducive to this venture, as the ITP performers had eclectic pieces ranging from acoustic classical to experimental electronic music.
From start to finish, “Cycles” ran just under twenty minutes. The projection screen was flanked by the performers: the quartet was on stage right (Christin Roman on cello, Tarani Merriweather on viola, and Nathan Bugh and Becky Day on violin), and Sam McCoy and I were on stage left. I very much liked this arrangement, as the screen was the centerpiece for the audience, while the performers were still present. The only problem was that due to space constraints on stage, I was in the back corner, so it was hard for me to see the projection screen. On the other hand, the small stage offered a side benefit: I got the sense that we were all crowding around an old family television. This fit the mood quite well, as my father’s work and the music is often intimate and contemplative, lending itself well to a small performance space.
After the show, I received a lot of positive feedback. My parents attended the show, and my father was deeply moved. Many people in the audience went up to him afterwards and complimented him on his photography (a few asked him for prints!). One audience member told me that she felt the visuals and the music belonged together, and that she felt a sense of emotional release at end of the third movement. I could not have hoped for a better response.
BIBLIOGRAPHY:


vii Sontag, p 3.
